

**Meeting conducted by: Ike Spencer**  
**Minutes taken by: Amanda Charlesworth**

**April 28, 2011 CMAC Minutes**

**Meeting started at 12:17pm.**

**Attendance Record:** Jeanette Misaka, Aida Santos-Mattingley, Jean Tokuda-Irwin, Ike Spencer, Sharee Varela, Charlene Lui, Charmaine Makanui-Costley, Kim Burningham, Martell Menlove, Richard Gomez, Edie Park, Harold Foster, Jeff Ojeda, Linda Oda, Amanda Charlesworth, Jennifer Lambert, Kristen Campbell

**Excused:** George Henry, Freddie Cooper, Christina Morales, Clara Helen Bedonie, Soulee L.K.O. Stroud, Rita Brock, Lillian Tsosie-Jensen

**Cultural Reverence:** Jean Tokuda-Irwin presented on an article from the Salt Lake Tribune: *Keep out inferior people*. We are seeing more examples of this attitude and not understanding that the action of the government doesn't always associate the culture of the people they represent. She distributed an origami crane to each member and explained what they represent to the Japanese culture. The Japanese festival will this weekend on Saturday April 30<sup>th</sup>.

**Item #1: Approval of March 24, 2011, meeting minutes**

- **Add Louie Gong to page 5**
- **1<sup>st</sup> – Charlene Lui**
- **2<sup>nd</sup> – Jeanette Misaka**
- **Motion carried.**

<b>Action Item: March 24, 2011, meeting minutes approved.</b>
---

**Item #2: Legislative Update – Martell Menlove**

- Passed out the legislative overview book and worksheet.
- Review of handout.
- 2% increase to overall budget. The final budget exceeded the governor's budget and the office is thankful for that. However, none of this takes into consideration the new student population, but still we are farther ahead than we have been in the past.
- WPU \$2700 goes to \$2816, however most of that money came out of a line item which was distributed the same as the WPU. By taking that line item out it actually decreased the actual WPU; the net decrease is a \$23 decrease.
- Districts and Charters Schools will continue to make cuts in staffing, programs will be cut etc because there are still fewer dollars than there were the year before.
- The items that were deemed important by USBE were funded by the legislature this year.
- Previously there were line items available for both at risk and accelerated students. This has been collapsed into one item.
- The concerns he sees, that CMAC might have, are that when they took the money and consolidated it for the programs that had previously been used for the at-risk population and consolidated them into one line item, called Enhancement for At-Risk Students. At the end it was \$8 million less than the previous year's funding. This block of funding only has a little over \$21 million in it this year.
  - The draft of a state board rule that will be considered at the next meeting. This draft rule comes from the previous rules for the at-risk populations. The only thing that is not left, consolidated 1.2 million that goes to gang prevention. The rest of the items have all been consolidated with the remaining funding from the line item.
  - Line 63 from the draft rule reviewed.

- The monies will be distributed based on poverty, mobility, ELL, low test scores on U-PASS percentages.
- If you have feedback please to give let Martell know. He asked how he can help CMAC with this issue.
- If you want to come to the board meeting next week you are welcome.
- **Ike Spencer** – The issue for CMAC is that literally all the programs that deal with students of color are now almost “optional” to address these programs for the students of color. While this population is the fastest growing population in Utah it seems to be the most popular place to cut funding.
- **Charlene Lui** – Because there is no money specifically set aside for it they are going to do away with the MESA program. There is data that shows the program is successful and yet now all the sudden that’s gone. We also know the Family Literacy Centers will be gone due to this funding cut. The Anti-affirmative action bill did not actually come out as a bill; however, it did come through in the bills that passed out of the Senate this year. So it is making progress in Utah.
- **Martell Menlove** – Would like to remind everyone that if a district chooses to have a MESA program or a Family Literacy Program they may do so. The feedback they are getting from the LEAs is that they want USOE to give them the money and let them make the decisions at the local level.
- **Charlene Lui** – As CMAC we represent all the students and districts of Utah. It is just unfortunate that everything CMAC recommended is not there. What did the state board recommend?
- **Martell Menlove** – They state board recommended no cuts of existing programs to fund new programs. However, the legislature went ahead with cuts to create new programs.
- **Sharee Varela** – So each school district gets \$5000 and has to be split up to whatever programs they want to keep?
- **Martell Menlove** - \$5000 is the base funding, if you have zero students who meet the criteria you will only get the base, but the other 96% of the money will be distributed based on the formula.
- **Sharee Varela** – It’s ironic that the gang prevention gets money specifically.
- **Martell Menlove** – 1.2 million of the at-risk block grant was a legislative item.
- **Ike Spencer** – It’s interesting to sit in the board meetings. It’s not really the board who makes these decisions it’s the legislature who makes these choices. He feels as though participating in a board meeting even as an audience member it’s an experience that may change you perception of the board. What is the overall thought process of the legislature that makes them feel they don’t need to fund these programs anymore?
- **Kim Burningham** – The squeaky wheel gets the grease. If CMAC can get the message across through the media etc. the message will get out to the people. The issue has to get out in the public media to get the legislature to respond to the issue.
- **Ike Spencer** – It always comes to a crisis before we respond.
- **Charlene Lui** – We met every Saturday at Horizante and many other organizations met, but the legislature did not listen to those groups.
- **Martell Menlove** – He would not attempt to read anyone’s mind. He can share some of the conversations he had with legislators. There were conversations about “these aren’t even our students” not in open conversations, but the tone is there. “There is already special Ed money, title I money, etc. so these populations don’t need our money also”. That was a fairly open conversation in the legislative appropriations meetings. Something we are going to need additional help on, say we put \$500,000, how many students are engineering and math students? What is the impact of the family literacy centers? Etc. We have to do a better job at advocating for this funding but backing this with data and facts.
- **Charlene Lui** – Apologizes for being emotional. As CMAC member she has worked with the state office in the past and finds USOE’s process for distributing funds takes too long. For example the ELL family

literacy centers. It took the USOE a long time, like 7 months, to get the money sent out to schools. The process was simply too long to make the program useful in the districts. Districts have data but we've got to develop a better way for USOE to show we are thankful for the money we have and we need more.

- **Martell Menlove** – USOE Administration knows they did not do as good of a job as they should have. They know they need to work on this issue.
- **Ike Spencer** – The problem is the information is there but it gets put on a shelf after all the data is collected. Sometimes it's like nailing Jell-O to a wall. It does not give CMAC credibility when we bring issues to the board, but then the board doesn't relay the message to the legislature.
- **Jean Tokuda-Irwin** – You mention about the evidence of the MESA program. Is there any way CMAC can ask for the evidence of all the other programs such as how much funding goes into sports, how many of those students go on to be pro ball players etc. We are a minority so even if we all speak together sometimes it's not loud enough. The legislature is not forcing these other areas with the same kind of scrutiny. It's a double standard. She feels these are the issues that need to come to light.
- **Martell Menlove** – When he said MESA, he was simply choosing one program. He could have said school nurses or school library books. He could have said any of those things. In a new rule this year there will be specific language about impact of funding on specific population of students. The legislature may continually change the questions they were asking USOE.
- **Ike Spencer** – Some of the legislators are professional politicians. Take Granite you have 68,000 students and over 29,000 are students of color. How do you go back to nearly half of your population and tell them we cut your funding but maintain the other populations funding.
- **Martell Menlove** – Has found the USBE to be responsive to specific requests and that USBE has great respect for CMAC. He feels CMAC can approach USBE specifically saying we want this item kept, we want more money in this program and so on. As a group you need to be more specific in those requests. If you contact any member of the USBE and ask them to explain how the \$8 million disappeared, most of them couldn't answer the question. However if you, as CMAC, make specific recommendations USBE can go to the legislature with specific requests of CMAC. He will facilitate that happening. We have been very upfront when we talked to people from legislators, to superintendents to PTA representatives. They are sharing that the money is cut there.
  - **The book is USOE's attempt to explain the 70 bills that impact education in the state of Utah.** There is a brief description of the bill and what needs to happen next. At the back there is a listing of bills that did not pass, and another list of ones that passed out of the house or the senate etc. The last few pages are the bills that are currently on the interim study list. This is USOE's summary of what happened at the 2011 legislature and the impact on Utah education.
- **Richard Gomez** – This item could go on all afternoon. This might be an important topic for the CMAC Retreat Day. We need to be careful of the passion and not point fingers. The data is out there, we just need to find a way to bring the data back in. Some of the districts have an OCR Title 6 compliance plan that will require funding to be spent the same way as previous years.
- **Charlene Lui** – There will not be a MESA rule?
- **Martell Menlove** – There may be districts that have MESA programs.
- **Charlene Lui** – If there is nothing at USOE to govern the MESA, Granite will create an organization to monitor the MESA programs.
- **Martell Menlove** – There will be governing of MESA at the USOE.
- **Ike Spencer** – We are just trying to ensure there are procedures in place.
- **Martell Menlove** – We've talked about BASE funding for the At-Risk line item funding, so charter schools and small districts have funding to do something with those programs. However, it is his opinion that the majority of the money needs to go to the districts and charters schools with the populations for whom the

funding was intended. This minimal BASE budget is going to allow that to happen. He would invite CMAC to be part of the conversation about BASE budgets. He would appreciate the feedback.

- **Ike Spencer** – This issue is something we need to have addressed at the CMAC Professional Development, we need to highlight some things happening and make the public aware we are left out of the loop.

### **Item #3: Equity in Action Conference Update – Richard Gomez**

- Jennifer Lambert WAS scheduled to present at the Equity in Action Conference. She advised Richard this morning that she is leaving USOE. He wants to give her a few minutes to address what these changes mean to the presentation.
- **Jennifer Lambert** – Will be at the Education Policy Center at U of U, so will still be working in education and doing research on these issues. She imagines you want someone from USOE to present these workshops. Kristen Campbell is the person who gathered the data and would be a great presenter. However, she still feels it is necessary to have a CMAC member pair with Kristen to help guide and direct as to what would be the most useful things to present at the conference. They have some ideas and NCS has developed an online course about Data Ethics. There are things in the NCS course that deals with some of the concerns CMAC raised at the March meeting. She thinks it would be useful to present.
- **Richard Gomez** – Someone from CMAC needs to step forward to help present this topic.
- **Charlene Lui** – Would be happy to help prepare the presentation but wouldn't be able to actually present the information at the conference.
- **Jean Tokuda-Irwin** – So you're asking CMAC to guide you to what are the most salient things for presenting.
- **Charlene Lui** – The specific assignment is "What box do I check" the new race/ethnicity data collection. Parents don't even understand the two step question.
- **Jennifer Lambert** – When those questions come up she would prefer a CMAC member respond or help form that response.
- **Jean Irwin-Tokuda** – As in asking the person about their family.
- **Ike Spencer** – It's a request to have a CMAC member co-present.
- **Charlene Lui** – We can meet before the retreat.
- **Kristen Campbell** – Is looking forward to working with CMAC.
- **Ike Spencer** – Thank you for coming.

#### **Action Item #3:**

- ***It is requested that one of the CMAC members Co-Present the Data session with USOE staff at the Equity in Action conference.***

### **Item #4: USOE Agency Survey Summary – Martell Menlove**

- Feedback is that USOE is not training their staff to keep their positions or to move to a position.
- 79% of USOE employees are strongly agreeing or somewhat agree they have the sufficient training to do their jobs at USOE.
- 86% strongly agreeing or somewhat agree that their duties are defined.
- Does USOE offer enough Professional Development? Only 55% were positive but a full 12% strongly disagree.
  - USOE is going to work on a Professional Development plan.
- Appreciates CMAC's role in this and moving this issue forward with the USOE.

- Many people come to USOE thinking this will be their last job. Some people come to USOE at the end of their career. That's the most typical employee comes to USOE. They come here to continue to earn credit toward state retirement but remove themselves from classrooms.
- Health benefits are the most important option offered.
- Most of the staff said they would prefer to keep things about the way they are.

#### **Item #5 Continued: Update on Equity Conference – Charlene Lui**

- For those of you who are not affiliated with a school district there is funding available to be sponsored to go to the conference.
- There are flyers Amanda can send for you to take to your communities to spread the word.
- On Saturday the Parent Day we really encourage you to attend. Dr. Linda Oda will facilitate open dialogue groups at the end of the day. What are we as parents looking for from education, what can USOE be doing?
- **Richard Gomez** – We are going to be asking CMAC members to not just attend; we would like you to help with some of the responsibilities of the conference. You will be approached by individuals specially to take on a role like a docent, or an introduction of workshop or perhaps with registration. You may not get a lot of recognition for it, but your help would be very useful. We hope to see all of you there. For those who are not here today we will be in contact with.
- **Charlene Lui** – There has been a request to do 104 flyers to personally give one to each of the legislators.
- **Ike Spencer** – His eyes have really been opened by being on CMAC and now being the principal of a school with a large population of students of color. But he still can't find parents to get on the committees even if he approaches them and personally invites them. If you have parents in his schools area please send them to him and he will pay the conference registration fee. Go to the principals in your areas that have the money, even at the Elementary school level, to pay the registration fees.
  - It's time to step up and realize this is important and take the time to attend the conference.
- **Richard Gomez** – When he went to Midvale Elementary the other day to observe the field test of the Utahfutures.org, parents who got less than 24 hours notice, got baby sitters came, with lunches etc. to attend this test session. We need to help motivate the parents! We need to use our creative genius to entice the parents to come, and otherwise do whatever it takes to get them to the conference.
- **Ike Spencer** – This is needed.

***Action Item #5 – CMAC members are asked to help facilitate the Equity in Action Conference as well as attend.***

#### **Item #6 – CMAC Nominees – Richard Gomez**

- USBE did not have an executive session last month, so they have not appointed anyone to fill the current CMAC openings. Will clarify what will happen at the next meeting.
- **The names sent in were:** Hispanic/Latino Nominees: Daniel Pacheco, Debbie Corsino-Moore, and Veronica Bori. American Indian Nominees: Beverly Fenton, Eugenia Groves, Nola D. Lodge-Hurford.
- **This is your opportunity to send in support letters as individual vs. as CMAC as a whole.**

**Kim Burningham** – The letters are extremely valuable because the USBE will turn to the CMAC representative for such input. He heard all the names and doesn't know any of them. He would like to have

information on each of them. **Kim's email address** [krb84010@aol.com](mailto:krb84010@aol.com) He would be glad to relay any information.

**Richard Gomez** – Any letters you write can go to the USBE secretary or to Kim as he has now volunteered. As always, to keep the Nominee Pool solvent, please continue to submit names often as we will have another round of vacancies coming on December 31, 2011. See the CMAC Directory re: terms of service.

**Ike Spencer** – Can someone explain the process of how CMAC is appointed by USBE?

\*Amanda will distribute contact information for Lorraine Austin, who is the secretary to USBE.

**Richard Gomez** – At this phase letters of support, from individual CMAC member need to be sent in.

**Ike Spencer** – Invitation to come to Westlake Jr. on Cinco de Mayo to celebrate and help with the schools fundraiser. This was a suggestion from the parents at the school.

**Action Item #6: Amanda will email the USBE's Secretary Contact info out to CMAC. Please contact Lorraine Austin if you need clarification on how CMAC members are appointed.**

**Item #7 Questions relating to the Strategic Plan for the Utah Arts Council – Jean Tokuda-Irwin**

- This is a chance for CMAC to have input onto a program that affects the parents and students CMAC is talking about at meetings.
- The funding goes to school all over the state. Think about the arts outside of the theater and ballet. Instead think of the cultural identity that is expressed through art forms.

Question #1 What do the arts mean to you as an individual and as a community?

- **Sharee Varela** – Comfort because when her antie used to weave rugs and you could hear her pounding the yarn.
- **Charmaine Makanui-Costley** – Uniqueness it still keeps an individual student unique and apart from others through their cultural art and music. It's unique to you apart from academia.
- **Adia Santos-Mattingley** – Harmony of Human Service – it really targets the home, the family and the school. The bottom line is it affects academic achievement.
- **Ike Spencer** – Creativity. He has never seen a kid that doesn't doodle or something that shows the creativity inside them.
- **Aida Santos-Mattingley** – It's a story to tell.
- **Charlene Lui** – For her son it was survival, when everything around him was chaos he turned to his art for survival.
- **Jeanette Misaka** – Enrichment of life.
- **Martell Menlove** – Reminder of positive past experiences.
- **Kim Burningham** – Self expression, it's the way you express what is inside you.
- **Jeff Ojeda** – Its Inclusion, in that art in it of its self is not exclusive there is not a right or a wrong way to do. It allows them to be involved in conversations.
- **Linda Oda** – Harmony, everyone has their music it brings together communities.
- **Dr. Foster** – Degree of performance in terms of everyone basically has a desire to perform and it might make it easier for a person to be more expressive at a higher peak.

Question #2 Considering challenges in your own arena what would you like to see happen in the arts in your community/school district (considering the challenges we face with politics, funding etc.)

- **Ike Spencer** – More access of available programs at the school where it doesn't always have to be a major assembly. So he can say he has artists in residence coming into the school from more backgrounds. We need more of an inventory of what groups are available and out there. And the value to the population, research based information.

- **Martell Menlove** – Would like to see the action of decision makers be consistent with the talk of decision makers. It's frustrating to hear resolutions supporting something where fiscal opportunities and associated resources don't reflect the resources. He would like to see decision makers who say they support the arts have some real action to prove they do support the arts. Have the talk do the walk!
- **Sharee Varela** – would like to see the arts back in the schools again. She remembers when they had class in schools. They explored different types of art etc. She sees the kids don't have a creative outlet and no resources or funding. She agrees with Martell they do need to support the arts.
- **Charmaine Makanui-Costley** – Would like to see more volunteers. You can't pay them, but schools are coming up with some funding within the school budget to come up with maybe part-time art teachers and artists in residents, but she really foresees volunteers having to take that action to go to schools and take the reins to volunteer to share their arts, dance, and their music. She doesn't see it coming anymore from state funding or any funding.
- **Aida Santos-Mattingley** – She would like to see perennial advocates for the arts in the community. She would like to have advocate and champions to have legislature stop cutting the funds.
- **Richard Gomez** – Is thinking back to when we used to have an artist bank. It was started, because back when, we discovered that many were being asked to volunteer their time, while others insisted on getting paid. There needs to be some more creative ways to reintroduce the support system for the artists. We need to be careful about how we promote volunteering.
- **Charlene Lui** – can we email more feedback to you later?
- **Jean Tokuda-Irwin** – Please.
- **Jean Tokuda-Irwin** – Ike, did you get the email inviting principals to apply for grants?
- **Ike Spencer** – No.
- **Sharee Varela** – It would be nice to have you and other representatives to come in and show different types of art.
- **Ike Spencer** – Westlake is going to a block schedule where kids will have a chance to go to enrichment activities.
  - Title I schools, when the grants and federal funding comes so quick, many of the artists etc. who were doing things for free all the sudden started charging these enormous prices to come and do things in the schools. In hind sight it looks like the schools don't appreciate the artists anymore, but the schools can't afford to pay for them anymore. If the artists would make themselves more available to the schools the way it used to be years ago, the schools could use them more.
- **Charlene Lui** – Often artists give up due to the requirements of the artists' bank. Is there somehow an easier way to recognize the masters of the arts?
- **Charmaine Makanui-Costley** – Is it a drawn out process to be part of the artist bank?
- **Jean Tokuda-Irwin** – Not anymore. If you would like to add to this conversation please reply to the email that was sent this week with the questions.

### Closing Discussions:

**Ike Spencer** – Alta High incident repercussions???

**Sharee Varela** – Attended the Canyons School District Board Meeting on March 31<sup>st</sup> it was a PTA meeting. They had a police officer there screening people as they entered the building. This meeting quickly clarified, to the audience that the meeting was not about the Alta high incident and the media was miscommunicating and giving misinformation that the meeting was going to be held there. The director of the PTA is Christina Talavara Flores. She's been in that position for two years. The position was created to address diversity and

equity issues for the minority students. The majority of the people there were Caucasian, which took them by surprise. They did a quick tally and came up with 50 Caucasian, 6 Hispanic, 2 African-Americans and 2 Asians.

**Charlene Lui** – There was a board meeting and it was streamed on the internet.

Sharee Varela – That meeting was the day before the meeting she attended due to the confusion in the media.

**Jean Tokuda-Irwin** – Speaking for the Utah PTA, there is a national program the PTA uses to try to encourage more minority parent involvement. Each state had to come up with a plan. They were told in no uncertain terms that engaging the minority parent population is going to be a major priority.

**Ike Spencer** – We need to get back on track. We need to figure out how CMAC is going to address this issue. The feedback from the community is the issue has been swept under the carpet and the community still wants the issue addressed. How can CMAC address this issue?

**Charlene Lui** – They are being approached by other groups who want to hold a town hall meeting. CMAC wants to make sure they honor and respect their position as CMAC; they don't want to get into a position where USBE or USOE thinks CMAC is bringing negativity. They want to find a way to bring this in a positive light.

**Charmaine Makanui-Costley** – We, as CMAC, need to find a way to deal with the media. It was the media who warped the story. She wants to make sure we talk about perceptions and how we deal.

Ike – Dr. Menlove we need a response.

**Martell Menlove** – You can take a formal position, you can request of the USBE, he can communicate these concerns with USBE.

**Charlene Lui** – We want to ask for permission to bring people together.

**Martell Menlove** – Will have to get answers and get back to CMAC.

**Jean Tokuda-Irwin** – Do you want CMAC to make any recommendations to the State PTA on the emerging minority leaders?

**Ike Spencer** – That is another topic for the retreat agenda.

**Sharee Varela** – What she did see in that meeting that was positive is the EML were minority and everyone else was not and they brought the issues up in a positive light. There were still color blind issues going on but there was that effort to educate.

**Jean Tokuda-Irwin** – they are trying but still having a hard time engaging the minority parents.

Jeff Ojeda – MESA video, not enough time to show all of it. Jeff will finalize the video and get it to CMAC to watch.

**Meeting Adjourned at 2:35 p.m.**